

**NYISO Business Issues Committee Meeting Minutes**  
**December 10, 2014**  
**10:00 a.m. – 12:30 p.m.**

---

**1. Introductions, Meeting Objectives, and Chairman's Report**

The vice chair of the Business Issues Committee (BIC), Mr. Chris LaRoe (US PowerGen) called the meeting to order at 10:10 a.m. by welcoming the members of the BIC. The members of the BIC identified themselves and attendance was recorded. A quorum was determined.

**2. Approval of Meeting Minutes – November 12, 2014**

Motion #1:

Motion to approve the Minutes of the November 12, 2014 BIC meeting.

***Motion passed unanimously.***

**3. Market Operations Report/Seams Report**

Mr. Rana Mukerji (NYISO) reviewed the Market Operations report included with the meeting material. There were no questions. Mr. Mukerji also reviewed the Seams Report included with the meeting material.

**4. Planning Update**

Mr. Henry Chao (NYISO) reported on recent planning activities and noted that the CARIS and RNA processes would be discussed at the ESPWG.

**5. Billing & Accounting Manual Update**

Ms. Michelle McLaughlin (NYISO) reviewed the proposed updates to the manual. There were no questions.

Motion #2:

The Business Issues Committee (BIC) hereby approves the Billing and Accounting Manual revisions associated with the CTS filing, removal of Non-Firm Point-to-Point transactions, and other ministerial changes as more fully described in the presentation made to the BIC on December 10, 2014.

***Motion passed unanimously with abstentions.***

**6. Comprehensive Shortage Pricing Discussion**

Mr. Mike DeSocio (NYISO) began by thanking Stakeholders for their efforts in working with the NYISO on this proposal. He explained that he recently had the opportunity to participate in a few technical conferences regarding uplift and price formation at the FERC. At the crux of those discussions was an overarching theme; the NYISO's market design is best in class. Time and time again, other participants of the conference would hold up NYISO market features as examples on how to construct an efficient market. He continued by stating that the NYISO has the Market Participants to thank for working with it and challenging the NYISO to create the best market design.

Mr. DeSocio stated he views the Comprehensive Shortage Pricing proposal as the next step in ensuring the New York market design remains best in class. Stakeholders have challenged the NYISO to bring forth the best and most workable changes to its market structure. The NYISO has been working on its

Comprehensive Shortage Pricing design since fall of 2013. It has been a long road, Mr. DeSocio mentioned, but the NYISO is nearing the end with this presentation and vote here today at the BIC.

In the past few weeks, NYISO has held many discussions with its stakeholders regarding the cost of this proposal. The NYISO does not take cost impacts on consumers lightly; however, the NYISO believes that the benefits of this proposal are far greater than its costs. In fact, the cost of this proposal is dwarfed by the costs of market changes proposed or being proposed by its neighbors. ISO-NE's performance incentive program is expected to cost over \$1 billion, and PJM's board recently approved PJM to follow suit with a performance proposal that will cost nearly \$5 billion.

With this in mind, he continued, there have been many discussions on the possibility of delaying implementation of this proposal until November 2015. While the NYISO expected that the comprehensive shortage pricing would be implemented as planned in June 2015, it believes that this alternative implementation date would be a reasonable compromise between generator and load interests. The NYISO has reviewed the 2015 cost impacts of such an alternative and found that implementing this proposal (in full) in November 2015 would result in 2015 costs of roughly \$25MM; roughly a reduction of \$100MM from costs related to a June 2015 implementation. As a reminder, the estimated 2015 costs for a June 2015 implementation were roughly \$125MM.

This initiative will enhance reliability and unit availability, and provide for fuel assurance and for more cost effective operation by ensuring that New York generators have a strong reason to be available for operation during cold and hot weather events. It will incent New York generators to make timely arrangements to procure fuel on a day-ahead basis.

New York is heavily reliant on natural gas. Increased reliance on natural gas, combined with recent extreme weather, compel the NYISO to take action to protect reliability by improving generator performance, unit availability and fuel assurance. The Comprehensive Shortage Pricing proposal will help achieve these objectives by providing long term economically efficient price signals and incentivizing the desired behavior by suppliers and consumers. In the short term, there may be price increases in the energy market. However, these price increases should be mostly offset by CTS-related savings. Once the demand curves are re-set for years beginning in 2017, increased energy prices from shortage pricing, if history is any guide, are expected to be offset by lower capacity costs. Moreover Comprehensive Shortage Pricing is expected to significantly improve the performance of the generator fleet during critical operating periods such as the polar vortex conditions New York experienced last winter. On January 7, 2014, more than 7,000 MW of generators were unavailable in New York. The NYISO expects this number to be significantly less once these market measures are implemented. Increased generator availability benefits consumers to the tune of \$200M for every 0.5% decrease in the Installed Reserve Margin (IRM). Delaying implementation of Comprehensive Shortage Pricing would delay performance and consumer benefits. The NYISO strongly believes that a November 2015 implementation date is prudent from both a reliability and consumer viewpoint.

Mr. Bill Heinrich (NYS DPS) stated he hopes the NYISO doesn't perform consumer impact analyses for nothing. Once we see price a tag on a proposal, it should impact whether to continue or to make changes. Procurement changes could be made in the SENY region to add an extra 600 MWs for a relatively modest price. Mr. Heinrich continued that the NYISO has the capacity market project that seems to be like it could be implemented in a revenue neutral way. When there is a large consumer impact, Mr. Heinrich advised that we should look at what we can do in a step wise fashion and come up with some sort of phase in plan. We haven't seen the NYISO sharpen its pencil on this, and there should be some rational way to phase this in.

Mr. Paul Gioia (TOs) stated the Transmission Owners see merit in the NYISO proposal but are concerned that our regulator feels all of the issues have not been fully vetted and they aren't comfortable with it. He suggested taking more time to discuss merits of proposal and concerns and also delaying the vote. TOs want an opportunity to discuss with the PSC so that they are comfortable with results. If the NYISO agrees that a November implementation is acceptable, then pushing off the vote won't be an issue.

Mr. Howard Fromer (PSEG) stated he was not sure why a delay would be productive except to give the TOs an opportunity to explain why they have been supportive on much of the proposal. We have a vote today and this will require going to the MC, therefore, TOs and the DPS have an opportunity between today and next week to have discussions and inform the PSC, who has been involved for months in the development. This is nothing new.

Ms. Doreen Saia (Greenburg Traurig for Entergy) explained the NYISO has answered the questions posed; doing the first two steps does nothing if you don't have the price behind it. If you look at what is happening in surrounding regions, PJM and ISO-NE are moving ahead aggressively. This topic is core to address fuel assurance and performance incentives, and that is the cornerstone of the NYISO's proposal. She expressed concern about the filing date and the need to get this before the Board in January. Ms. Saia added these are efficiency changes. The stakeholders expedited CTS, both suppliers and load heavily supported those changes as they produced more efficient results despite prices being lower. She said it was disturbing that cost was overriding having more efficient markets and that it was a dangerous path if we permit price impacts to derail improvements to market efficiency. New York is not an island.

Ms. Liz Grisaru (NYSDPS) said the DPS believes this proposal has substantial merit but is concerned about the mismatch between immediate consumer impact and much less certain offset or integration into the Demand Curve reset. She said that DPS wanted to understand better the impact because DPS needed to know how the ratepayers would be impacted.

Mr. David Clark (Power Supply Long Island) stated he supported the overall proposal because it would reduce contingencies. However, Power Supply Long Island would be willing to defer a vote to reach a broader consensus..

Mr. Andrew Antinori (NYPA) said it seemed unusual that we vote now and not file with FERC for six or seven months. He said that the DPS has legitimate concerns and NYPA did not see any harm in delaying vote for a month. In response, Mr. Fromer explained that there are software issues; and even under the best of circumstances if the Board approved in January 2015, it would still be five (5) months before software could go live.

Mr. Bart Franey (National Grid) said the month delay wasn't really so much to improve upon the proposal, but it was more to see if a November date was feasible and what the pros and cons were and to generate more support of the proposal. The PSC was left out of the discussion and if they are asking for more time, it doesn't seem to be a huge disruption in the proposal. He said that National Grid supported the proposal and supported delaying for a month to let the PSC do their examination.

Mr. Mark Younger (Hudson Energy Economics for Indeck) pointed to the NYISO's upcoming February 2015 report to FERC on fuel assurance and said that Comprehensive Shortage Pricing is a significant piece to provide the right incentives and it assures suppliers procure reserves in the right location to meet the SRC's reserves restoration obligation. The proposal directly addresses reliability issues. He

expressed concern that if the stakeholders don't vote now and February comes, the NYISO will have nothing to show to FERC on fuel assurance because the PSC slowed us down.

Mr. Ting Chan (Central Hudson) stated that he supported the proposal, but is looking for assurance that when it comes to Demand Curve reset that we tried 100% to reflect our cost. Given what we heard from the PSC, Central Hudson is supportive of a delay and feels it is in their best interest.

Proposed Motion #3:

The Business Issues Committee ("BIC") hereby recommends that the Management Committee approve changes to the NYISO's OATT and MST with regard to the Comprehensive Shortage Pricing updates as more fully described in the presentation made to the BIC on December 10, 2014.

Mr. Scott Leuthauser (HQUS) made a motion to amend proposed motion #3 to delay implementation. The mover and seconder deemed the amendment as unfriendly and requested a roll call vote. The motion was acted upon before the language was visible on the screen.

Motion #3A

Motion to amend Motion 3 to delay implementation to November 1, 2015.

***Motion passed with 94.23% affirmative votes.***

Mr. Antinori made a motion to table Motion #3 and requested a roll call vote.

Motion #3B:

Motion to table motion 3.

***Motion failed with 46.55% affirmative votes.***

After the motion to table failed, the BIC Chair instructed that the committee would now take the vote on the motion as amended. Mr. Rick Brophy (NYSEG) asked for the motion to be put on the screen. After the language was put on the screen, Con Edison proposed to change the word "delay" to "postpone". NYISO counsel advised that the motion could not be changed because the vote on the motion to amend had already been taken. Ms. Saia indicated that this language did not reflect the motion that Entergy had been seconding. She noted that the NYISO has confirmed at this meeting that the software for the shortage pricing proposal will be deployed in the "OFF" position in June and will be ready to be implemented at that time. Entergy strongly feels that it should be implemented in June to allow the efficiencies that it will bring to the market to be seen and to give the NYISO more data to be used in the next demand curve reset process to allow the net Energy and Ancillary Services revenue projections to be accurate. However, it was made known by several market participants leading up to the vote that they would not vote in favor of a June implementation and would only vote in favor of a November implementation. Because Entergy feels that it is critical to get these market rule changes to FERC for review, Entergy was willing to second the motion but the motion language should have simply stated "with an implementation date of November 1, 2015" to reflect the intent of the movants.

Motion #3:

The Business Issues Committee ("BIC") hereby recommends that the Management Committee approve changes to the NYISO's OATT and MST with regard to the Comprehensive Shortage Pricing updates as presented and amended to delay implementation to November 1, 2015 at the BIC on December 10, 2014.

**Motion passed with 83.96% affirmative votes.**

## **7. Working Group Updates**

- a. *Billing and Accounting Working Group* – Ms. Eckels reported that the group reviewed the grid accounting report and the proposed Billing & Accounting Manual update.
- b. *Credit Policy Working Group* – Mr. Norman Mah (Con Ed Solutions) NYISO proposed to require all market participants to submit annual financial statements, starting July 2015. Companies with unaudited statements can submit an officer certification of accuracy to waive the audit requirement. Proposal will be voted on early 2015. The Credit Management System will be modified for the projected true-up exposure. The true-up exposure will require additional collateral if a Load Server repetitively under forecast its load by more than 90%. Will be put in service February 2015. Registration will be required for training will be in January 2015.
- c. *Electric Gas Coordination Working Group* – The group has not met since the last BIC.
- d. *Electric System Planning Working Group* – No update.
- e. *Installed Capacity Working Group* – Mr. LaRoe reported that the ICAP completed the Market Monitor's ICAP market recommendations as well as continued discussions on Increased CRIS and began discussions on predefining and eliminating capacity zones.
- f. *Inter-regional Planning Task Force* – No update.
- g. *Load Forecasting Task Force* – Mr. Bryan Irrgang reported the group discussed the 2014 Weather Normalized Peak and 2015 ICAP Forecast.
- h. *Market Issues Working Group* – Chris LaRoe (US PowerGen) reported that MIWG met jointly with PRLWG to review the Behind the Meter Generation Initiative and Market Concepts for Distributed Energy Resources. Discussions continued on Comprehensive Shortage Pricing as well as reviews of fuel changes in reference levels, the reference level manual, fuel availability self-reporting, TCC Markets Attachment L revisions and an update on MIPs. Potomac Economics also provided its Q3 State of the Market Report.
- i. *Price Responsive Load Working Group* – See MIWG update.

## **8. New Business**

None

The meeting adjourned at 12:35 p.m.

# ***Business Issues Committee Meeting***

## **December 10, 2014**

### **Final Motions**

---

#### Motion #1:

Motion to approve the Minutes of the November 12, 2014 BIC meeting.

*Motion passed unanimously.*

#### Motion #2:

The Business Issues Committee (BIC) hereby approves the Billing and Accounting Manual revisions associated with the CTS filing, removal of Non-Firm Point-to-Point transactions, and other ministerial changes as more fully described in the presentation made to the BIC on December 10, 2014.

*Motion passed unanimously with abstentions.*

#### Motion #3A

Motion to amend Motion 3 to delay implementation to November 1, 2015.

*Motion passed with 94.23% affirmative votes.*

#### Motion #3B:

Motion to table motion 3.

*Motion failed with 46.55% affirmative votes.*

#### Motion #3:

The Business Issues Committee ("BIC") hereby recommends that the Management Committee approve changes to the NYISO's OATT and MST with regard to the Comprehensive Shortage Pricing updates as presented and amended to delay implementation to November 1, 2015 at the BIC on December 10, 2014.

*Motion passed with 83.96% affirmative votes.*

**New York Independent System Operator**  
**Business Issues Committee - December 10, 2014**

**Motion: Motion #Motion to Amend**

**Result: Motion Passed**

Sector with base percent	%	Active	Quorum	Adj. Percent	For	Against	Abstain	% For	% Against	
Generation Owners	21.50	✓	✓	21.50	2.00	0.00	3.00	21.50	0.00	
Other Suppliers	21.50	✓	✓	21.50	8.00	0.00	7.00	21.50	0.00	
Transmission Owners	20.00	✓	✓	20.00	3.00	0.00	1.00	20.00	0.00	
End Use Consumer			✓							
Large Consumer	9.00	✓		9.00	5.00	0.00	0.00	10.33	0.00	
Large Cons. Gov. Agency	2.00	✓		2.00	0.00	0.00	0.00	0.00	0.00	
Small Consumer	4.50	✓	✓	4.50	6.00	0.00	1.00	5.17	0.00	
Gov. State-wide Cons. Advocate	2.70	✓		2.70	0.00	0.00	1.00	0.00	0.00	
Gov. Sm. Cons. & Retail Aggr.	1.80	✓		1.80	1.00	0.00	1.00	4.50	0.00	
Public Power			✓							
State Power Authorities	8.00	✓		9.07	1.00	0.00	1.00	9.07	0.00	
Munis & Co-ops	7.00	✓		7.93	3.00	8.00	0.00	2.16	5.77	
Environmental	2.00	✓		0.00	0.00	0.00	0.00	0.00	0.00	
				5	100.00	29.00	8.00	15.00	94.23	5.77
					100.00	Normalize to 100% :		94.23	5.77	

# New York Independent System Operator

## Business Issues Committee - December 10, 2014

**Motion: Motion #Motion to Amend**

**Result: Motion Passed**

Sector	Organization	Representative	Affiliate	Present	For	Against
Generation Owners	Indeck Energy Services, Inc.	Younger, Mark	N	Y	0.00	0.00
Generation Owners	Astoria Energy LLC	LaRoe, Chris	N	Y	1.00	0.00
Generation Owners	Calpine		N	N	0.00	0.00
Generation Owners	CPV Valley LLC		N	N	0.00	0.00
Generation Owners	East Coast Power, LLC		N	N	0.00	0.00
Generation Owners	Entergy Nuclear Northeast	Saia, Doreen	N	Y	1.00	0.00
Generation Owners	Innovative Energy Systems		N	N	0.00	0.00
Generation Owners	New Athens Generating Co. LLC		N	N	0.00	0.00
Generation Owners	Noble Environmental Power LLC		N	N	0.00	0.00
Generation Owners	Selkirk Cogen Partners, LP		N	N	0.00	0.00
Generation Owners	TC Ravenswood, Inc.	Congel, Dan	N	Y	0.00	0.00
Generation Owners	EDP Renewables North America LLC		N	N	0.00	0.00
Generation Owners	Cricket Valley Energy Center		N	N	0.00	0.00
Generation Owners	Invenergy Energy Management LLC		N	N	0.00	0.00
Generation Owners	National Grid Generation LLC		Y	N	0.00	0.00
Generation Owners	Somerset Operating Company, LLC	Evanoski, Dave	N	Y	0.00	0.00
Generation Owners	Howard Wind LLC		N	N	0.00	0.00
Generation Owners	Stephentown Spindle, LLC		N	N	0.00	0.00
Other Suppliers	Hess Corporation		N	N	0.00	0.00
Other Suppliers	BJ Energy LLC		N	N	0.00	0.00
Other Suppliers	Brookfield Energy Marketing	Francis, Frank	N	Y	0.00	0.00
Other Suppliers	Citigroup Energy Inc.		N	N	0.00	0.00
Other Suppliers	Con Edison Solutions Inc.		Y	N	0.00	0.00
Other Suppliers	Constellation New Energy		Y	N	0.00	0.00
Other Suppliers	Cross Sound Cable Company, LLC		Y	N	0.00	0.00
Other Suppliers	DC Energy		N	N	0.00	0.00
Other Suppliers	DTE Energy	German, Robert	N	Y	0.00	0.00
Other Suppliers	Dynegy Power Marketing, Inc.	Roby, Rick	N	Y	1.00	0.00
Other Suppliers	Energy Spectrum		N	N	0.00	0.00
Other Suppliers	EnerNoc		N	N	0.00	0.00
Other Suppliers	Galt Power	Ackerman, Alan	N	Y	0.00	0.00
Other Suppliers	HQ Energy Services US	Leuthauser, Scott	N	Y	1.00	0.00
Other Suppliers	Integrus Energy Services of New York, Inc		N	N	0.00	0.00
Other Suppliers	Morgan Stanley Capital Group, Inc.		N	N	0.00	0.00
Other Suppliers	NRG Power Marketing Inc.	Younger, Mark	N	Y	1.00	0.00
Other Suppliers	Ontario Power Generation, Inc.		N	N	0.00	0.00
Other Suppliers	Exelon Generating Co. LLC	McCartney, Glen	N	Y	0.00	0.00
Other Suppliers	PPL EnergyPlus, LLC		N	N	0.00	0.00
Other Suppliers	PSEG Energy Resource & Trade, LLC	Fromer, Howard	N	Y	0.00	0.00
Other Suppliers	SESCO Enterprises, LLC		N	N	0.00	0.00
Other Suppliers	Shell Energy North America, LLC		N	N	0.00	0.00
Other Suppliers	TransCanada Power Marketing, Ltd.		Y	N	0.00	0.00
Other Suppliers	U.S. Power Generating Co.	Baker, Liam	N	Y	1.00	0.00
Other Suppliers	J.P. Morgan Ventures Energy Corporatio		N	N	0.00	0.00
Other Suppliers	BP Energy Company		N	N	0.00	0.00
Other Suppliers	EDF Trading North America, LLC		N	N	0.00	0.00
Other Suppliers	NextEra Energy	LaRoe, Chris	N	Y	1.00	0.00
Other Suppliers	Innoventive Power		N	N	0.00	0.00



Sector	Organization	Representative	Affiliate	Present	For	Against
Other Suppliers	Vitol Inc.		N	N	0.00	0.00
Other Suppliers	GDF Suez Energy NA, Inc.		Y	N	0.00	0.00
Other Suppliers	Viridity Energy, Inc.		N	N	0.00	0.00
Other Suppliers	Riverbay Corporation		N	N	0.00	0.00
Other Suppliers	Converge/Enerwise Global Technologies	Ackerman, Alan	N	Y	0.00	0.00
Other Suppliers	EnergyConnect	Lawrence, David	N	Y	1.00	0.00
Other Suppliers	Twin Cities Power LLC		N	N	0.00	0.00
Other Suppliers	Castleton Commodities Merchant Trading L.P.		N	N	0.00	0.00
Other Suppliers	Great Bay Energy IV, LLC		N	N	0.00	0.00
Other Suppliers	BlueRock Energy, Inc.		N	N	0.00	0.00
Other Suppliers	Noble Americas Gas & Power Corp.	Boston, Roy	N	Y	1.00	0.00
Other Suppliers	Lyonsdale Biomass, LLC	Carrigan, Kathleen	N	Y	1.00	0.00
Other Suppliers	Direct Energy Business Marketing, LLC	Philips, Marjorie	N	Y	0.00	0.00
Other Suppliers	Energy Technology Savings		N	N	0.00	0.00
Transmission Owners	New York State Electric & Gas (NYSEG)	Brophy, Richard	N	Y	1.00	0.00
Transmission Owners	Central Hudson Gas & Electric Corp.	Chan, Ting	N	Y	1.00	0.00
Transmission Owners	Consolidated Edison Co. of NY, Inc.	Miller, Richard	N	Y	0.00	0.00
Transmission Owners	National Grid	Franey, Bart	N	Y	1.00	0.00
Transmission Owners	Orange & Rockland Utilities, Inc.		Y	N	0.00	0.00
Transmission Owners	Rochester Gas and Electric Corp.		Y	N	0.00	0.00
End Use - Large Consumer	Alcoa, Inc.	Mager, Michael	N	Y	1.00	0.00
End Use - Large Consumer	IBM Corporation	Mager, Michael	N	Y	1.00	0.00
End Use - Large Consumer	Occidental Chemical Corp.	Mager, Michael	N	Y	1.00	0.00
End Use - Large Consumer	Wegmans Food Markets	Mager, Michael	N	Y	1.00	0.00
End Use - Large Consumer	Nucor Steel Auburn, Inc.	Brew, James	N	Y	1.00	0.00
End Use - Large Cons. Gov. Agency	Metropolitan Transportation Authority		N	N	0.00	0.00
End Use - Small Consumer	American Sugar Refining, Inc	Mager, Michael	N	Y	1.00	0.00
End Use - Small Consumer	Beth Israel Health Care System	Mager, Michael	N	Y	1.00	0.00
End Use - Small Consumer	Fordham University	Mager, Michael	N	Y	1.00	0.00
End Use - Small Consumer	Memorial Sloan Kettering Cancer Center	Mager, Michael	N	Y	1.00	0.00
End Use - Small Consumer	Mount Sinai Medical Center	Mager, Michael	N	Y	1.00	0.00
End Use - Small Consumer	New York University	Mager, Michael	N	Y	1.00	0.00
End Use - Small Consumer	Association for Energy Affordability	Strauss, Valerie	N	Y	0.00	0.00
End Use - Gov. State-wide Cons. Advocate	Utility Intervention Unit, Division of Consumer Protection, NY Dept. of State	Hall, Chris	N	Y	0.00	0.00
End Use - Gov. Sm. Cons. & Retail Aggr.	NYS Energy Research & Dev. Authority	Hall, Christopher	N	Y	0.00	0.00
End Use - Gov. Sm. Cons. & Retail Aggr.	City of New York	Mager, Michael	N	Y	1.00	0.00
Public Power - State Power Authorities	Long Island Power Authority	Clarke, Dave	N	Y	1.00	0.00
Public Power - State Power Authorities	New York Power Authority	Antinori, Andrew	N	Y	0.00	0.00
Public Power - Munis & Co-ops	Bath Electric, Gas & Water Systems	Bolbrock, Richard	N	Y	0.00	1.00
Public Power - Munis & Co-ops	Freeport Electric	Rudebusch, Tom	N	Y	1.00	0.00
Public Power - Munis & Co-ops	Jamestown Board of Public Utilities	Rudebusch, Tom	N	Y	1.00	0.00
Public Power - Munis & Co-ops	Lake Placid Village	Bolbrock, Richard	N	Y	0.00	1.00
Public Power - Munis & Co-ops	Municipal Commission of Boonville	Bolbrock, Richard	N	Y	0.00	1.00
Public Power - Munis & Co-ops	Plattsburgh Municipal Lighting Dept	Bolbrock, Richard	N	Y	0.00	1.00
Public Power - Munis & Co-ops	Village of Westfield	Bolbrock, Richard	N	Y	0.00	1.00
Public Power - Munis & Co-ops	Village of Solvay	Bolbrock, Richard	N	Y	0.00	1.00
Public Power - Munis & Co-ops	Village of Arcade	Bolbrock, Richard	N	Y	0.00	1.00
Public Power - Munis & Co-ops	Village of Fairport	Bolbrock, Richard	N	Y	0.00	1.00
Public Power - Munis & Co-ops	Village of Rockville Centre	Rudebusch, Tom	N	Y	1.00	0.00
Public Power - Environmental	American Lung Association		N	N	0.00	0.00
Public Power - Environmental	American Wind Energy Association		N	N	0.00	0.00
Public Power - Environmental	Environmental Advocates		N	N	0.00	0.00
Public Power - Environmental	Natural Resources Defense Council		N	N	0.00	0.00
Public Power - Environmental	PACE Energy & Climate Center		N	N	0.00	0.00
Public Power - Environmental	Riverkeeper		N	N	0.00	0.00

**New York Independent System Operator**  
**Business Issues Committee - December 10, 2014**

**Motion: Motion #Motion to Table**

**Result: Motion Failed**

Sector with base percent	%	Active	Quorum	Adj. Percent	For	Against	Abstain	% For	% Against	
Generation Owners	21.50	✓	✓	21.50	0.00	5.00	0.00	0.00	21.50	
Other Suppliers	21.50	✓	✓	21.50	0.00	10.00	5.00	0.00	21.50	
Transmission Owners	20.00	✓	✓	20.00	3.00	0.00	1.00	20.00	0.00	
End Use Consumer			✓							
Large Consumer	9.00	✓		9.00	0.00	0.00	5.00	0.00	0.00	
Large Cons. Gov. Agency	2.00	✓		2.00	0.00	0.00	0.00	0.00	0.00	
Small Consumer	4.50	✓	✓	4.50	0.00	0.00	7.00	0.00	0.00	
Gov. State-wide Cons. Advocate	2.70	✓		2.70	1.00	0.00	0.00	2.70	0.00	
Gov. Sm. Cons. & Retail Aggr.	1.80	✓		1.80	1.00	0.00	1.00	1.80	0.00	
Public Power			✓							
State Power Authorities	8.00	✓		9.07	2.00	0.00	0.00	9.07	0.00	
Munis & Co-ops	7.00	✓		7.93	8.00	3.00	0.00	5.77	2.16	
Environmental	2.00	✓		0.00	0.00	0.00	0.00	0.00	0.00	
				5	100.00	15.00	18.00	19.00	39.34	45.16
					100.00	Normalize to 100% :		46.55	53.45	

**New York Independent System Operator**  
**Business Issues Committee - December 10, 2014**

**Motion: Motion #Motion to Table**

**Result: Motion Failed**

Sector	Organization	Representative	Affiliate	Present	For	Against
Generation Owners	Indeck Energy Services, Inc.	Younger, Mark	N	Y	0.00	1.00
Generation Owners	Astoria Energy LLC	LaRoe, Chris	N	Y	0.00	1.00
Generation Owners	Calpine		N	N	0.00	0.00
Generation Owners	CPV Valley LLC		N	N	0.00	0.00
Generation Owners	East Coast Power, LLC		N	N	0.00	0.00
Generation Owners	Entergy Nuclear Northeast	Saia, Doreen	N	Y	0.00	1.00
Generation Owners	Innovative Energy Systems		N	N	0.00	0.00
Generation Owners	New Athens Generating Co. LLC		N	N	0.00	0.00
Generation Owners	Noble Environmental Power LLC		N	N	0.00	0.00
Generation Owners	Selkirk Cogen Partners, LP		N	N	0.00	0.00
Generation Owners	TC Ravenswood, Inc.	Congel, Dan	N	Y	0.00	1.00
Generation Owners	EDP Renewables North America LLC		N	N	0.00	0.00
Generation Owners	Cricket Valley Energy Center		N	N	0.00	0.00
Generation Owners	Invenergy Energy Management LLC		N	N	0.00	0.00
Generation Owners	National Grid Generation LLC		Y	N	0.00	0.00
Generation Owners	Somerset Operating Company, LLC	Evanoski, Dave	N	Y	0.00	1.00
Generation Owners	Howard Wind LLC		N	N	0.00	0.00
Generation Owners	Stephentown Spindle, LLC		N	N	0.00	0.00
Other Suppliers	Hess Corporation		N	N	0.00	0.00
Other Suppliers	BJ Energy LLC		N	N	0.00	0.00
Other Suppliers	Brookfield Energy Marketing	Francis, Frank	N	Y	0.00	1.00
Other Suppliers	Citigroup Energy Inc.		N	N	0.00	0.00
Other Suppliers	Con Edison Solutions Inc.		Y	N	0.00	0.00
Other Suppliers	Constellation New Energy		Y	N	0.00	0.00
Other Suppliers	Cross Sound Cable Company, LLC		Y	N	0.00	0.00
Other Suppliers	DC Energy		N	N	0.00	0.00
Other Suppliers	DTE Energy	German, Robert	N	Y	0.00	0.00
Other Suppliers	Dynegy Power Marketing, Inc.	Roby, Rick	N	Y	0.00	1.00
Other Suppliers	Energy Spectrum		N	N	0.00	0.00
Other Suppliers	EnerNoc		N	N	0.00	0.00
Other Suppliers	Galt Power	Ackerman, Alan	N	Y	0.00	0.00
Other Suppliers	HQ Energy Services US	Leuthauser, Scott	N	Y	0.00	1.00
Other Suppliers	Integrus Energy Services of New York, Inc		N	N	0.00	0.00
Other Suppliers	Morgan Stanley Capital Group, Inc.		N	N	0.00	0.00
Other Suppliers	NRG Power Marketing Inc.	Younger, Mark	N	Y	0.00	1.00
Other Suppliers	Ontario Power Generation, Inc.		N	N	0.00	0.00
Other Suppliers	Exelon Generating Co. LLC	McCartney, Glen	N	Y	0.00	1.00
Other Suppliers	PPL EnergyPlus, LLC		N	N	0.00	0.00
Other Suppliers	PSEG Energy Resource & Trade, LLC	Fromer, Howard	N	Y	0.00	1.00
Other Suppliers	SESCO Enterprises, LLC		N	N	0.00	0.00
Other Suppliers	Shell Energy North America, LLC		N	N	0.00	0.00
Other Suppliers	TransCanada Power Marketing, Ltd.		Y	N	0.00	0.00
Other Suppliers	U.S. Power Generating Co.	Baker, Liam	N	Y	0.00	1.00
Other Suppliers	J.P. Morgan Ventures Energy Corporatio		N	N	0.00	0.00
Other Suppliers	BP Energy Company		N	N	0.00	0.00
Other Suppliers	EDF Trading North America, LLC		N	N	0.00	0.00
Other Suppliers	NextEra Energy	LaRoe, Chris	N	Y	0.00	1.00
Other Suppliers	Innoventive Power		N	N	0.00	0.00

Sector	Organization	Representative	Affiliate	Present	For	Against
Other Suppliers	Vitol Inc.		N	N	0.00	0.00
Other Suppliers	GDF Suez Energy NA, Inc.		Y	N	0.00	0.00
Other Suppliers	Viridity Energy, Inc.		N	N	0.00	0.00
Other Suppliers	Riverbay Corporation		N	N	0.00	0.00
Other Suppliers	Converge/Enerwise Global Technologies	Ackerman, Alan	N	Y	0.00	0.00
Other Suppliers	EnergyConnect	Lawrence, David	N	Y	0.00	0.00
Other Suppliers	Twin Cities Power LLC		N	N	0.00	0.00
Other Suppliers	Castleton Commodities Merchant Trading L.P.		N	N	0.00	0.00
Other Suppliers	Great Bay Energy IV, LLC		N	N	0.00	0.00
Other Suppliers	BlueRock Energy, Inc.		N	N	0.00	0.00
Other Suppliers	Noble Americas Gas & Power Corp.	Boston, Roy	N	Y	0.00	1.00
Other Suppliers	Lyonsdale Biomass, LLC	Carrigan, Kathleen	N	Y	0.00	1.00
Other Suppliers	Direct Energy Business Marketing, LLC	Philips, Marjorie	N	Y	0.00	0.00
Other Suppliers	Energy Technology Savings		N	N	0.00	0.00
Transmission Owners	New York State Electric & Gas (NYSEG)	Brophy, Richard	N	Y	1.00	0.00
Transmission Owners	Central Hudson Gas & Electric Corp.	Chan, Ting	N	Y	1.00	0.00
Transmission Owners	Consolidated Edison Co. of NY, Inc.	Miller, Richard	N	Y	1.00	0.00
Transmission Owners	National Grid	Franey, Bart	N	Y	0.00	0.00
Transmission Owners	Orange & Rockland Utilities, Inc.		Y	N	0.00	0.00
Transmission Owners	Rochester Gas and Electric Corp.		Y	N	0.00	0.00
End Use - Large Consumer	Alcoa, Inc.	Mager, Michael	N	Y	0.00	0.00
End Use - Large Consumer	IBM Corporation	Mager, Michael	N	Y	0.00	0.00
End Use - Large Consumer	Occidental Chemical Corp.	Mager, Michael	N	Y	0.00	0.00
End Use - Large Consumer	Wegmans Food Markets	Mager, Michael	N	Y	0.00	0.00
End Use - Large Consumer	Nucor Steel Auburn, Inc.	Brew, James	N	Y	0.00	0.00
End Use - Large Cons. Gov. Agency	Metropolitan Transportation Authority		N	N	0.00	0.00
End Use - Small Consumer	American Sugar Refining, Inc	Mager, Michael	N	Y	0.00	0.00
End Use - Small Consumer	Beth Israel Health Care System	Mager, Michael	N	Y	0.00	0.00
End Use - Small Consumer	Fordham University	Mager, Michael	N	Y	0.00	0.00
End Use - Small Consumer	Memorial Sloan Kettering Cancer Center	Mager, Michael	N	Y	0.00	0.00
End Use - Small Consumer	Mount Sinai Medical Center	Mager, Michael	N	Y	0.00	0.00
End Use - Small Consumer	New York University	Mager, Michael	N	Y	0.00	0.00
End Use - Small Consumer	Association for Energy Affordability	Strauss, Valerie	N	Y	0.00	0.00
End Use - Gov. State-wide Cons. Advocate	Utility Intervention Unit, Division of Consumer Protection, NY Dept. of State	Hall, Chris	N	Y	1.00	0.00
End Use - Gov. Sm. Cons. & Retail Aggr.	NYS Energy Research & Dev. Authority	Hall, Christopher	N	Y	1.00	0.00
End Use - Gov. Sm. Cons. & Retail Aggr.	City of New York	Mager, Michael	N	Y	0.00	0.00
Public Power - State Power Authorities	Long Island Power Authority	Clarke, Dave	N	Y	1.00	0.00
Public Power - State Power Authorities	New York Power Authority	Antinori, Andrew	N	Y	1.00	0.00
Public Power - Munis & Co-ops	Bath Electric, Gas & Water Systems	Bolbrock, Richard	N	Y	1.00	0.00
Public Power - Munis & Co-ops	Freeport Electric	Rudebusch, Tom	N	Y	0.00	1.00
Public Power - Munis & Co-ops	Jamestown Board of Public Utilities	Rudebusch, Tom	N	Y	0.00	1.00
Public Power - Munis & Co-ops	Lake Placid Village	Bolbrock, Richard	N	Y	1.00	0.00
Public Power - Munis & Co-ops	Municipal Commission of Boonville	Bolbrock, Richard	N	Y	1.00	0.00
Public Power - Munis & Co-ops	Plattsburgh Municipal Lighting Dept	Bolbrock, Richard	N	Y	1.00	0.00
Public Power - Munis & Co-ops	Village of Westfield	Bolbrock, Richard	N	Y	1.00	0.00
Public Power - Munis & Co-ops	Village of Solvay	Bolbrock, Richard	N	Y	1.00	0.00
Public Power - Munis & Co-ops	Village of Arcade	Bolbrock, Richard	N	Y	1.00	0.00
Public Power - Munis & Co-ops	Village of Fairport	Bolbrock, Richard	N	Y	1.00	0.00
Public Power - Munis & Co-ops	Village of Rockville Centre	Rudebusch, Tom	N	Y	0.00	1.00
Public Power - Environmental	American Lung Association		N	N	0.00	0.00
Public Power - Environmental	American Wind Energy Association		N	N	0.00	0.00
Public Power - Environmental	Environmental Advocates		N	N	0.00	0.00
Public Power - Environmental	Natural Resources Defense Council		N	N	0.00	0.00
Public Power - Environmental	PACE Energy & Climate Center		N	N	0.00	0.00
Public Power - Environmental	Riverkeeper		N	N	0.00	0.00

# New York Independent System Operator

## Business Issues Committee - December 10, 2014

Motion: Motion #Original Motion

Result: Motion Passed

Sector with base percent	%	Active	Quorum	Adj. Percent	For	Against	Abstain	% For	% Against	
Generation Owners	21.50	✓	✓	21.50	4.00	0.00	1.00	21.50	0.00	
Other Suppliers	21.50	✓	✓	21.50	8.00	0.00	7.00	21.50	0.00	
Transmission Owners	20.00	✓	✓	20.00	2.00	1.00	1.00	13.33	6.67	
End Use Consumer			✓							
Large Consumer	9.00	✓		9.00	4.00	0.00	1.00	10.33	0.00	
Large Cons. Gov. Agency	2.00	✓		2.00	0.00	0.00	0.00	0.00	0.00	
Small Consumer	4.50	✓	✓	4.50	6.00	0.00	1.00	5.17	0.00	
Gov. State-wide Cons. Advocate	2.70	✓		2.70	0.00	1.00	0.00	0.00	2.70	
Gov. Sm. Cons. & Retail Aggr.	1.80	✓		1.80	1.00	1.00	0.00	0.90	0.90	
Public Power			✓							
State Power Authorities	8.00	✓		9.07	1.00	0.00	1.00	9.07	0.00	
Munis & Co-ops	7.00	✓		7.93	3.00	8.00	0.00	2.16	5.77	
Environmental	2.00	✓		0.00	0.00	0.00	0.00	0.00	0.00	
				5	100.00	29.00	11.00	12.00	83.96	16.04
					100.00	Normalize to 100% :		83.96	16.04	

# New York Independent System Operator

## Business Issues Committee - December 10, 2014

**Motion: Motion #Original Motion**

**Result: Motion Passed**

Sector	Organization	Representative	Affiliate	Present	For	Against
Generation Owners	Indeck Energy Services, Inc.	Younger, Mark	N	Y	1.00	0.00
Generation Owners	Astoria Energy LLC	LaRoe, Chris	N	Y	1.00	0.00
Generation Owners	Calpine		N	N	0.00	0.00
Generation Owners	CPV Valley LLC		N	N	0.00	0.00
Generation Owners	East Coast Power, LLC		N	N	0.00	0.00
Generation Owners	Entergy Nuclear Northeast	Saia, Doreen	N	Y	1.00	0.00
Generation Owners	Innovative Energy Systems		N	N	0.00	0.00
Generation Owners	New Athens Generating Co. LLC		N	N	0.00	0.00
Generation Owners	Noble Environmental Power LLC		N	N	0.00	0.00
Generation Owners	Selkirk Cogen Partners, LP		N	N	0.00	0.00
Generation Owners	TC Ravenswood, Inc.	Congel, Dan	N	Y	0.00	0.00
Generation Owners	EDP Renewables North America LLC		N	N	0.00	0.00
Generation Owners	Cricket Valley Energy Center		N	N	0.00	0.00
Generation Owners	Invenergy Energy Management LLC		N	N	0.00	0.00
Generation Owners	National Grid Generation LLC		Y	N	0.00	0.00
Generation Owners	Somerset Operating Company, LLC	Evanoski, Dave	N	Y	1.00	0.00
Generation Owners	Howard Wind LLC		N	N	0.00	0.00
Generation Owners	Stephentown Spindle, LLC		N	N	0.00	0.00
Other Suppliers	Hess Corporation		N	N	0.00	0.00
Other Suppliers	BJ Energy LLC		N	N	0.00	0.00
Other Suppliers	Brookfield Energy Marketing	Francis, Frank	N	Y	0.00	0.00
Other Suppliers	Citigroup Energy Inc.		N	N	0.00	0.00
Other Suppliers	Con Edison Solutions Inc.		Y	N	0.00	0.00
Other Suppliers	Constellation New Energy		Y	N	0.00	0.00
Other Suppliers	Cross Sound Cable Company, LLC		Y	N	0.00	0.00
Other Suppliers	DC Energy		N	N	0.00	0.00
Other Suppliers	DTE Energy	German, Robert	N	Y	0.00	0.00
Other Suppliers	Dynegy Power Marketing, Inc.	Roby, Rick	N	Y	1.00	0.00
Other Suppliers	Energy Spectrum		N	N	0.00	0.00
Other Suppliers	EnerNoc		N	N	0.00	0.00
Other Suppliers	Galt Power	Ackerman, Alan	N	Y	0.00	0.00
Other Suppliers	HQ Energy Services US	Leuthauser, Scott	N	Y	1.00	0.00
Other Suppliers	Integrus Energy Services of New York, Inc		N	N	0.00	0.00
Other Suppliers	Morgan Stanley Capital Group, Inc.		N	N	0.00	0.00
Other Suppliers	NRG Power Marketing Inc.	Younger, Mark	N	Y	1.00	0.00
Other Suppliers	Ontario Power Generation, Inc.		N	N	0.00	0.00
Other Suppliers	Exelon Generating Co. LLC	McCartney, Glen	N	Y	0.00	0.00
Other Suppliers	PPL EnergyPlus, LLC		N	N	0.00	0.00
Other Suppliers	PSEG Energy Resource & Trade, LLC	Fromer, Howard	N	Y	0.00	0.00
Other Suppliers	SESCO Enterprises, LLC		N	N	0.00	0.00
Other Suppliers	Shell Energy North America, LLC		N	N	0.00	0.00
Other Suppliers	TransCanada Power Marketing, Ltd.		Y	N	0.00	0.00
Other Suppliers	U.S. Power Generating Co.	Baker, Liam	N	Y	1.00	0.00
Other Suppliers	J.P. Morgan Ventures Energy Corporatio		N	N	0.00	0.00
Other Suppliers	BP Energy Company		N	N	0.00	0.00
Other Suppliers	EDF Trading North America, LLC		N	N	0.00	0.00
Other Suppliers	NextEra Energy	LaRoe, Chris	N	Y	1.00	0.00
Other Suppliers	Innoventive Power		N	N	0.00	0.00

Sector	Organization	Representative	Affiliate	Present	For	Against
Other Suppliers	Vitol Inc.		N	N	0.00	0.00
Other Suppliers	GDF Suez Energy NA, Inc.		Y	N	0.00	0.00
Other Suppliers	Viridity Energy, Inc.		N	N	0.00	0.00
Other Suppliers	Riverbay Corporation		N	N	0.00	0.00
Other Suppliers	Converge/Enerwise Global Technologies	Ackerman, Alan	N	Y	0.00	0.00
Other Suppliers	EnergyConnect	Lawrence, David	N	Y	1.00	0.00
Other Suppliers	Twin Cities Power LLC		N	N	0.00	0.00
Other Suppliers	Castleton Commodities Merchant Trading L.P.		N	N	0.00	0.00
Other Suppliers	Great Bay Energy IV, LLC		N	N	0.00	0.00
Other Suppliers	BlueRock Energy, Inc.		N	N	0.00	0.00
Other Suppliers	Noble Americas Gas & Power Corp.	Boston, Roy	N	Y	1.00	0.00
Other Suppliers	Lyonsdale Biomass, LLC	Carrigan, Kathleen	N	Y	1.00	0.00
Other Suppliers	Direct Energy Business Marketing, LLC	Philips, Marjorie	N	Y	0.00	0.00
Other Suppliers	Energy Technology Savings		N	N	0.00	0.00
Transmission Owners	New York State Electric & Gas (NYSEG)	Brophy, Richard	N	Y	1.00	0.00
Transmission Owners	Central Hudson Gas & Electric Corp.	Chan, Ting	N	Y	0.00	1.00
Transmission Owners	Consolidated Edison Co. of NY, Inc.	Miller, Richard	N	Y	0.00	0.00
Transmission Owners	National Grid	Franey, Bart	N	Y	1.00	0.00
Transmission Owners	Orange & Rockland Utilities, Inc.		Y	N	0.00	0.00
Transmission Owners	Rochester Gas and Electric Corp.		Y	N	0.00	0.00
End Use - Large Consumer	Alcoa, Inc.	Mager, Michael	N	Y	1.00	0.00
End Use - Large Consumer	IBM Corporation	Mager, Michael	N	Y	1.00	0.00
End Use - Large Consumer	Occidental Chemical Corp.	Mager, Michael	N	Y	1.00	0.00
End Use - Large Consumer	Wegmans Food Markets	Mager, Michael	N	Y	1.00	0.00
End Use - Large Consumer	Nucor Steel Auburn, Inc.	Brew, James	N	Y	0.00	0.00
End Use - Large Cons. Gov. Agency	Metropolitan Transportation Authority		N	N	0.00	0.00
End Use - Small Consumer	American Sugar Refining, Inc	Mager, Michael	N	Y	1.00	0.00
End Use - Small Consumer	Beth Israel Health Care System	Mager, Michael	N	Y	1.00	0.00
End Use - Small Consumer	Fordham University	Mager, Michael	N	Y	1.00	0.00
End Use - Small Consumer	Memorial Sloan Kettering Cancer Center	Mager, Michael	N	Y	1.00	0.00
End Use - Small Consumer	Mount Sinai Medical Center	Mager, Michael	N	Y	1.00	0.00
End Use - Small Consumer	New York University	Mager, Michael	N	Y	1.00	0.00
End Use - Small Consumer	Association for Energy Affordability	Strauss, Valerie	N	Y	0.00	0.00
End Use - Gov. State-wide Cons. Advocate	Utility Intervention Unit, Division of Consumer Protection, NY Dept. of State	Hall, Chris	N	Y	0.00	1.00
End Use - Gov. Sm. Cons. & Retail Aggr.	NYS Energy Research & Dev. Authority	Hall, Christopher	N	Y	0.00	1.00
End Use - Gov. Sm. Cons. & Retail Aggr.	City of New York	Mager, Michael	N	Y	1.00	0.00
Public Power - State Power Authorities	Long Island Power Authority	Clarke, Dave	N	Y	1.00	0.00
Public Power - State Power Authorities	New York Power Authority	Antinori, Andrew	N	Y	0.00	0.00
Public Power - Munis & Co-ops	Bath Electric, Gas & Water Systems	Bolbrock, Richard	N	Y	0.00	1.00
Public Power - Munis & Co-ops	Freeport Electric	Rudebusch, Tom	N	Y	1.00	0.00
Public Power - Munis & Co-ops	Jamestown Board of Public Utilities	Rudebusch, Tom	N	Y	1.00	0.00
Public Power - Munis & Co-ops	Lake Placid Village	Bolbrock, Richard	N	Y	0.00	1.00
Public Power - Munis & Co-ops	Municipal Commission of Boonville	Bolbrock, Richard	N	Y	0.00	1.00
Public Power - Munis & Co-ops	Plattsburgh Municipal Lighting Dept	Bolbrock, Richard	N	Y	0.00	1.00
Public Power - Munis & Co-ops	Village of Westfield	Bolbrock, Richard	N	Y	0.00	1.00
Public Power - Munis & Co-ops	Village of Solvay	Bolbrock, Richard	N	Y	0.00	1.00
Public Power - Munis & Co-ops	Village of Arcade	Bolbrock, Richard	N	Y	0.00	1.00
Public Power - Munis & Co-ops	Village of Fairport	Bolbrock, Richard	N	Y	0.00	1.00
Public Power - Munis & Co-ops	Village of Rockville Centre	Rudebusch, Tom	N	Y	1.00	0.00
Public Power - Environmental	American Lung Association		N	N	0.00	0.00
Public Power - Environmental	American Wind Energy Association		N	N	0.00	0.00
Public Power - Environmental	Environmental Advocates		N	N	0.00	0.00
Public Power - Environmental	Natural Resources Defense Council		N	N	0.00	0.00
Public Power - Environmental	PACE Energy & Climate Center		N	N	0.00	0.00
Public Power - Environmental	Riverkeeper		N	N	0.00	0.00

# New York Independent System Operator - Committee Membership

## Business Issues Committee - December 10, 2014 - NYISO - Parties Checked in Attendance

Organization	Sector	Representative	Alternate1	Alternate2	Alternate3	Alternate4	Alternate5	Alternate6	Alternate7	Proxy	Guest
Astoria Energy LLC	Generation Owners	McCall, Chuck	Habib , Phillipe	Singer, Leonard						✓ LaRoe, Chris	
CPV Valley LLC	Generation Owners	Remillard, Steven	Litchfield , Matt	Bruno , Michael	Felak, Rich						
Calpine	Generation Owners	Kruse, Brett	Reitmeyer , Jay	Flumerfelt, John	Schleimer , Steve						
Cricket Valley Energy Center	Generation Owners	De Meyere , Bob	Wallenstein , Arnold	Ahrens , Jeff							
EDP Renewables North America LLC	Generation Owners	Berruecos , Pablo	Fitzgerald , Daniel								
East Coast Power, LLC	Generation Owners	Shanker, Roy	Fogarty , Thomas	Fisher , Amy							
Entergy Nuclear Northeast	Generation Owners	Milici , Rich	Potkin , Marc	✓Saia, Doreen	Del Orto , Ken						
Howard Wind LLC	Generation Owners	Merich , Olivia	Rugh , Chris								
Indeck Energy Services, Inc.	Generation Owners	Ferguson, Mike	Schrage, John	✓Younger, Mark							
Innovative Energy Systems	Generation Owners	Zeliff, Peter	Henningham, Scott								
Invenergy Energy Management LLC	Generation Owners	Ma , Alex	Goldstein , Michael	Orzel , Chris							
National Grid Generation LLC	Generation Owners	Kain , Terrence	McCabe , Brian								
New Athens Generating Co. LLC	Generation Owners	Breen, Jack	Litchfield , Matt	DeVinney, Dan	Felak, Rich						
Noble Environmental Power LLC	Generation Owners	Silton , Harry									
Selkirk Cogen Partners, LP	Generation Owners	Biittig, Timothy	Ryan , James								
Somerset Operating Company, LLC	Generation Owners	✓Evanoski , Dave	Goodenough , Jeery								
Stephentown Spindle, LLC	Generation Owners	Hebert , Chris	Bullwinkel , Aaron	O'Brien , Robin							
TC Ravenswood, Inc.	Generation Owners	Taylor, William	DAndrea , James	✓Congel, Dan	Hachey, Mike						
BJ Energy LLC	Other Suppliers	Ni, Bing	Lee, George								
BP Energy Company	Other Suppliers	Prescott , Randy	Magruder , Kathy	Bassett , Jeffrey							
BlueRock Energy, Inc.	Other Suppliers	Nichols , Jim	Eno , Jason	VanHorne , Phil	Gipson , Jon						
Brookfield Energy Marketing	Other Suppliers	✓Francis, Frank	Ricketts, Robert	Whyte, Daniel							
Castleton Commodities Merchant Trading L.P.	Other Suppliers	Stuss , Gordon	Cheong, Mei								
Citigroup Energy Inc.	Other Suppliers	Trayers, Barry									
Comverge/Enerwise Global Technologies	Other Suppliers	Geoghan , Stephen	Lacey , Frank	✓Ackerman, Alan							
Con Edison Solutions Inc.	Other Suppliers	✓Mah, Norman	Wemple, Steve								
Constellation New Energy	Other Suppliers	✓McCartney, Glen	✓Wentlent, Chris	Kirk , Steven							
Cross Sound Cable Company, LLC	Other Suppliers	Reinhart, Brian	Rotger, Jose								
DC Energy	Other Suppliers	Bleiweis, Bruce	Stevens, Andrew	Tate, Matthew	Milberg, Sadao	Kuo, David					
DTE Energy	Other Suppliers	Pakela, Gregory	Wieszczyk, Raymond	✓German , Robert							
Direct Energy Business Marketing, LLC	Other Suppliers	✓Philips , Marjorie	Comstock , Read								
Dynegy Power Marketing, Inc.	Other Suppliers	✓Roby , Rick	Ellis, Dean	Daley , Marty							
EDF Trading North America, LLC	Other Suppliers	Erbrick , Michael	LeForce , Randall								
EnerNoc	Other Suppliers	Brewster, David	Breidenbaugh, Aaron	Geller , Greg							
Energy Spectrum	Other Suppliers	David, Gary	Ahrens, David	Neiburg, David	Iskowitz, Aron	Brown, Ruben	Pentland , William	Villegas , Cristina			
Energy Technology Savings	Other Suppliers	Hendler , Jeff	Ross , Valerie	Nudelman , Craig							
EnergyConnect	Other Suppliers	Campbell , Bruce	Davis , Robert	✓Lawrence , David							
Exelon Generating Co. LLC	Other Suppliers	✓McCartney, Glen	✓Wentlent, Chris	Kirk , Steven							
GDF Suez Energy NA, Inc.	Other Suppliers	Levine , Jeffrey	Hawkins , Darin	Campbell , Chad							
Galt Power	Other Suppliers	Fernands , Rochelle	✓Ackerman, Alan								
Great Bay Energy IV, LLC	Other Suppliers	Franco , Eugene	Colon , Antonio								
HQ Energy Services US	Other Suppliers	Bernier , Luc	Plante , Matthieu	✓Leuthauser, Scott	Vennes, Yannick						
Hess Corporation	Other Suppliers	Sobieski, Dennis									
Innoventive Power	Other Suppliers	Gruber , Craig	Halford , Steve								
Integrus Energy Services of New York, Inc	Other Suppliers	Haugh, Michael									
J.P. Morgan Ventures Energy Corporatio	Other Suppliers	O'Connell , Robert	Greenleaf , Steven								
Lyonsdale Biomass, LLC	Other Suppliers	Ralston , William	Hebel , Nathan	✓Carrigan , Kathleen							
Morgan Stanley Capital Group, Inc.	Other Suppliers	Murray, Patrick	Kochonies, Karen	Ezickson, Doron							
NRG Power Marketing Inc.	Other Suppliers	Joseph , Kelli	Fuller , Peter	Neal , David						✓Younger, Mark	
NextEra Energy	Other Suppliers	Applebaum, David	Gardner , Michelle	Gil , David						✓LaRoe, Chris	
Noble Americas Gas & Power Corp.	Other Suppliers	✓Boston , Roy	Kyle , Chris	Sunga , Leonard							
Ontario Power Generation, Inc.	Other Suppliers	Lacivita, Ken	Gell, Richard	Barr, David	Sheinfield , Joel						
PPL EnergyPlus, LLC	Other Suppliers	Weghorst, Brad	Hyzinski, Tom	Weber, Sharon	Greening , Michele	Yannarell, David	Francello , Mark				
PSEG Energy Resource & Trade, LLC	Other Suppliers	✓Fromer, Howard	Carretta , Kenneth	Messmer , Robert	Murawski , James						
Riverbay Corporation	Other Suppliers	Merola , Peter	Freedman , Herbert	Ahrens, David	Villegas , Cristina						
SESCO Enterprises, LLC	Other Suppliers	Schubiger, Michael	Thoresen, James								
Shell Energy North America, LLC	Other Suppliers	Picardi, Matt	French, Dave								
TransCanada Power Marketing, Ltd.	Other Suppliers	Taylor, William	D'Andrea, James	✓Congel, Dan	Hachey, Mike						



Organization	Sector	Representative	Alternate1	Alternate2	Alternate3	Alternate4	Alternate5	Alternate6	Alternate7	Proxy	Guest
Twin Cities Power LLC	Other Suppliers	Staska , Stephanie	Dube , Alex								
U.S. Power Generating Co.	Other Suppliers	✓Baker, Liam	Reese, John	✓LaRoe , Chris							
Viridity Energy, Inc.	Other Suppliers	Freifeld , Allen									
Vitol Inc.	Other Suppliers	Wadsworth , Joe	Viola , Bob	Kam , Kenney							
Central Hudson Gas & Electric Corp.	Transmission Owners	Borchert , John	✓Chan, Ting	Seitz, Diane	Dittmann, David						
Consolidated Edison Co. of NY, Inc.	Transmission Owners	✓Miller, Richard	Nachmias, Stuart	Altohell, Deidre	✓Butler , Scott	Butterklee, Neil					
National Grid	Transmission Owners	✓Franey, Bart	Lodemore , David								
New York State Electric & Gas (NYSEG)	Transmission Owners	Caletka, Patricia	Kinney, Ray	✓Brophy , Richard							
Orange & Rockland Utilities, Inc.	Transmission Owners		Kinney, Ray	✓Brophy , Richard							
Rochester Gas and Electric Corp.	Transmission Owners	Caletka, Patricia									
Alcoa, Inc.	Large Consumer	Loughney, Robert	✓Mager, Michael	Bissell, Garrett	Lang, Kevin						
IBM Corporation	Large Consumer	Loughney, Robert	✓Mager, Michael	Bissell, Garrett	Lang, Kevin						
Nucor Steel Auburn, Inc.	Large Consumer	✓Brew , James	Radigan, Frank	Kopon , Owen							
Occidental Chemical Corp.	Large Consumer	Loughney, Robert	✓Mager, Michael	Bissell, Garrett	Lang, Kevin						
Wegmans Food Markets	Large Consumer	Loughney, Robert	✓Mager, Michael	Bissell, Garrett	Lang, Kevin						
Metropolitan Transportation Authority	Large Consumer Government Agency	Keller , David	Chou , Frances								
American Sugar Refining, Inc	Small Consumer	George, Quintin	Luthin, Catherine	Dowling, John	Loughney, Robert	✓Mager, Michael	Bissell, Garrett				
Association for Energy Affordability	Small Consumer	Morris, Jackson	Hepinstall, David	✓Strauss , Valerie							
Beth Israel Health Care System	Small Consumer	Luthin, Catherine	Dowling, John	Loughney, Robert	✓Mager, Michael	Bissell, Garrett					
Fordham University	Small Consumer	Dowling, John	Luthin, Catherine	Loughney, Robert	✓Mager, Michael	Bissell, Garrett					
Memorial Sloan Kettering Cancer Center	Small Consumer	Dowling, John	Luthin, Catherine	Loughney, Robert	✓Mager, Michael	Bissell, Garrett					
Mount Sinai Medical Center	Small Consumer	Luthin, Catherine	Dowling, John	Loughney, Robert	✓Mager, Michael	Bissell, Garrett					
New York University	Small Consumer	Luthin, Catherine	Dowling, John	Loughney, Robert	✓Mager, Michael	Bissell, Garrett					
Utility Intervention Unit, Division of Consumer Protection, NY Dept. of State	Government Statewide Consumer Advocate	Hogan , Erin	Rigberg, Saul	Collar , Gregg	Panko , Danielle	Battle , Aiesha				✓Hall, Chris	
City of New York	Government Small Consumer and Retail Aggregate	Lang, Kevin	Bissell, Garrett	Delaney, Michael	✓Mager, Michael	Trinsey , Amanda					
NYS Energy Research & Dev. Authority	Government Small Consumer and Retail Aggregate	Williams, John	✓Hall , Christopher	d'Aversa , Jon-Paul							
Long Island Power Authority	State Power Authorities	✓Clarke, Dave	McNally , Stephen								
New York Power Authority	State Power Authorities	✓Antinori , Andrew	✓Boyle, Bob	Fossa , Andrea	✓Mahoney , Daniel	✓Wilkie , Brian					
Bath Electric, Gas & Water Systems	Municipalities and Coops	Moore, Ken	✓Bolbrock, Richard	Cordeiro, Mark							
Freeport Electric	Municipalities and Coops	Livingston , Al	Kimlingen, Ted	✓Rudebusch, Tom	Fiore , Chris						
Jamestown Board of Public Utilities	Municipalities and Coops	Gustafson, David	Leathers, David	Kulig, Steve	✓Rudebusch, Tom						
Lake Placid Village	Municipalities and Coops	Kroha, Peter	✓Bolbrock, Richard	Cordeiro, Mark							
Municipal Commission of Boonville	Municipalities and Coops	Stabb, Kenneth	✓Bolbrock, Richard	Cordeiro, Mark							
Plattsburgh Municipal Lighting Dept	Municipalities and Coops	Treacy, William	✓Bolbrock, Richard	Cordeiro, Mark							
Village of Arcade	Municipalities and Coops	Kilburn, Larry	✓Bolbrock, Richard	Cordeiro, Mark							
Village of Fairport	Municipalities and Coops	Moore, Ken	✓Bolbrock, Richard	Cordeiro, Mark							
Village of Rockville Centre	Municipalities and Coops	Andreas , Philip	Cardile , Thomas	✓Rudebusch, Tom							
Village of Solvay	Municipalities and Coops	Mondre, Judith	✓Bolbrock, Richard	Cordeiro, Mark							
Village of Westfield	Municipalities and Coops	Hamilton, James	✓Bolbrock, Richard	Cordeiro, Mark							
American Lung Association	Environmental	Gahl , David	Seilback, Michaek	Miller , Edward							
American Wind Energy Association	Environmental	Strauss, Valerie	Gramlich, Robert								
Environmental Advocates	Environmental	Bambrick , Conor	Gahl , David	Morris, Jackson							
Natural Resources Defense Council	Environmental	Morris, Jackson	Clements , Allison	Kennedy , Kit							
PACE Energy & Climate Center	Environmental	Gahl , David	Bowie , John	Morris, Jackson							
Riverkeeper	Environmental	Gallay , Paul	Gahl , David	Morris, Jackson							
Ace Energy Company, Inc.	Non Voting	Lynch, Stephen									
Air Energy TCI, Inc.	Non Voting	O'Connor , Brett									
Alliance for Clean Energy New York	Non Voting	Reynolds , Anne									
Anbaric Northeast Transmission Development Co.	Non Voting	Sanderson , Barry									
Beacon Power LLC	Non Voting	Hebert , Chris	Bullwinkel , Aaron	O'Brien , Robin							
Boston Energy Marketing & Trading	Non Voting	✓Kramek , Mike									
Boundless Energy, LLC	Non Voting	Tompkins John, E.	Pratt , Charles								
Bruce Power	Non Voting	Viswanathan , Samira	Meyer , Sandra								
CP Energy Marketing (US) Inc.	Non Voting	Bursaw , Christopher	Renouf , James	Kirby , Amber							
Caithness Energy LLC	Non Voting	Keevill , Gary	Delgado , Jeffrey	Garber, Mitchell							
Customized Energy Solutions	Non Voting	Mancini, Rick	Fernands, Stephen	Rexrode, Caryn	✓Ackerman, Alan	✓Lundin , Tim					
Demand Response Partners	Non Voting	Dorn , Andrew	Almeter , Carl	Hourihan , Michael							
Ecogen	Non Voting	Hagner, Thomas									
Energetix, Inc.	Non Voting	Comstock , Read									
Energy Curtailment Specialists	Non Voting	Pieniasek, Marie	✓Scheiderich , Jim	Lynch, Stephen	Korczykowski , Jim						

Organization	Sector	Representative	Alternate1	Alternate2	Alternate3	Alternate4	Alternate5	Alternate6	Alternate7	Proxy	Guest
First Wind Holdings, LLC	Non Voting	Keene , John	Salehian , Afshin								
Fluent Energy	Non Voting	Acampora , Peter	Begley, Jeff	Doll , Ed							
Hudson River Energy Group	Non Voting	Radigan, Frank	Canfield, Richard								
Hydro-Quebec TransEnergie	Non Voting	Prevost , Michel									
Iberdrola Renewables Inc	Non Voting	Allen, Thresa									
MAG Energy Solutions, Inc.	Non Voting	Roberge, Martin	Vezina, Alexandre								
NYS Department of Public Service	Non Voting	✓ Paynter , Thomas	Evans , Adam								✓ Heinrich, William
Noble Americas Energy Solutions	Non Voting	Sun , Jungsuk	Nakhonthap , Jade	Sunga , Leonard							
Northeast Clean Heat & Power Initiative	Non Voting	De Veer , Henrietta	Lilian , Jon	Dwyer , Herb	Brown, Ruben	Cinadr , Matt	Martin , Nicholas	Villegas , Cristina			
RBC Energy Services, LP	Non Voting	Burnham , Steve	Fraiture , Christian	Doolittle , Robin							
Red Wolf Energy Trading, LLC	Non Voting	Sharma , Rishi									
Saracen Energy East LP	Non Voting	Peebles , Andy									
Saranac Power Partners	Non Voting	Wible , Steven									
Siemens Energy, Inc.	Non Voting	Feltes , James									
Taylor Biomass Energy, LLC	Non Voting	Taylor , Jim	Page , Allan								
TransAlta	Non Voting	Nivolianitis , Ted									
Transmission Developers Inc.	Non Voting	Jessome , Donald	Helmer , William								
William P. Short	Non Voting	Short, William	Schaefer, Marc		Savage, Paul	Verna, Jim					